

Appendix M – Acute options appraisal detailed scoring

Individual CMG scores

Options	CMG 1 Prof Services, Imaging, Med Physics & Empath											CMG 2 Womens and Childrens							CMG 3 Cardiac, Renal and Respiratory							CMG 4 Emergency & Special Medicine							CMG 5 Critical Care, Theatres, Anaesthetics, Pain and Sleep																																								
	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total													
Option 1	168	132	132	132	108	108	108	96	140	140	16	1280	168	220	132	132	180	36	36	224	196	196	48	1568	392	220	220	220	252	180	360	320	196	196	80	2724	168	220	132	132	108	108	108	160	140	84	80	1512	280	308	308	220	180	36	36	224	196	196	112	2000	56	132	132	220	108	36	36	224	196	140	80	80	1112
Option 2	280	132	132	132	180	180	108	160	140	84	48	1576	168	132	44	132	180	36	36	160	84	196	16	1184	392	220	220	220	308	180	360	320	196	196	80	2724	168	308	220	108	180	180	180	224	140	140	112	2000	280	308	220	132	180	36	36	224	196	140	80	80	1576												
Option 3/5	392	308	308	308	360	360	252	224	140	140	112	2904	392	308	308	308	252	180	252	224	140	140	112	2616	392	440	308	440	360	252	360	320	196	196	112	3376	392	440	440	440	360	360	360	224	196	280	112	3604	560	308	440	440	440	252	360	180	224	84	28	160	3036												
Options	CMG 6 Cancer, Haem GI Med & Surg											CMG 7 Musculoskeletal and Specialist Surgery							CMG 8 Patient Representative							CMG 9 Commissioners*							CMG 10 Directors*																																								
	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money (qualitative)	Total																									
Option 1	280	132	44	44	108	36	36	96	140	196	48	1160	168	220	44	132	108	108	252	32	140	140	48	1392	280	220	132	132	180	180	36	32	140	140	16	1400	84	77	66	55	54	54	54	28	42	42	12	564	84	66	66	88	54	54	54	90	64	42	42	652													
Option 2	280	132	44	44	108	108	180	160	140	140	48	1384	168	220	44	132	108	108	252	32	140	140	48	1392	392	132	132	132	180	180	36	32	140	140	16	1512	70	66	33	55	36	54	63	21	42	42	12	508	140	110	66	110	54	90	90	80	70	42	56	948													
Option 3/5	392	440	440	440	252	252	360	224	140	140	112	3192	560	220	308	132	252	252	180	224	196	196	112	2632	560	220	308	220	108	252	180	224	84	84	80	2320	88	77	110	55	63	63	63	35	35	35	20	675	196	154	220	220	126	126	180	160	98	98	56	1634													

Overall scores by CMG

Options	CMG's										Option score	Rank
	CMG 1 - CSI	CMG 2- W&C	CMG 3- CRR	CMG 4-E & SM	CMG 5 - ITAPS	CMG 6 - CHUGGS	CMG 7 - Muscu & Spec Surgery	CMG 8 - HEAL THWATCH	CMG 9 - CCGS	CMG 10- DIRECTORS		
Option 1	1280	1568	2724	1512	1112	1160	1392	1400	564	652	13364	3
Option 2	1576	1184	2724	2000	1976	1384	1392	1512	508	948	15204	2
Option 3/5	2904	2616	3376	3604	3036	3192	2632	2320	675	1634	25989	1

Overall scores by Benefit Criteria

Options	Total - all CMGs												Option score	Rank
	Benefit Criteria													
	Improved Health Outcomes	Quality of Patient Experience	Improved Service Delivery	Improved Staff Experience and Motivation	Stakeholder Impact	Strategic Fit	Flexibility for the Future	Improved Facilities	Feasibility and Timescale	Ease of Implementation	Value for Money-(qualitative)	Total		
Option 1	1848	1639	1100	1375	1188	828	1134	1112	1358	1330	452	13364	13364	3
Option 2	2338	1760	1155	1397	1386	1152	1485	1448	1267	1316	500	15204	15204	2
Option 3/5	3934	2915	3190	3003	2385	2457	2367	2104	1309	1337	988	25989	25989	1